

THE ROLE OF SPIRITUAL AND FORMAL EFFECTS IN THE PERCEPTION OF EMOTIONAL STATES CONSTITUTING A WORK OF ART



SANAT ESERİNİ OLUŞTURAN DUYGU DURUMLARI İLE ALGILANMASINDAKİ TİNSEL VE BİÇİMSEL ETKİLERİN ROLÜ

Seyhan MERCAN KALAYCI*

ÖZ: Sanat eserini oluşturan duygu durumları, bir teori veya kuram, birçok sistemin organizasyonuna ilişkin gerçekleri ve olayları açıklayan ayrıca bir çalışma alanının temelini oluşturan bir dizi kural ve düzenliliğin etkileri ile oluşur. Sanatın genel tanımını verecek bir teori geliştiren, sınırlarını çizen, bir şeye “sanat eseri” dememizi sağlayan nitelikleri belirleyen olguların başında duygular ve biçimsel hazlar ve tinsel yaklaşımlar yer almaktadır. Ayrıca sanat, doğa ve insanın nesnel gerçeklerle olan estetiği ile ilgilidir. Sanatçı için gerçeklik olarak nitelendirilen varlığın temsili olarak görme ve kavrama ile belirginleşen duygusal hisler sanatta ele alınacak konulara bağlıdır. İnsana ait bir yeti olan sanat, var olmanın temsili niteliğindedir. Sanatçı için doğadaki gerçek nesnelere, estetik algıları fark etmeye yardımcı olur. Buna ilaveten bireysel olarak ortaya çıkan duygusal durumlar, objektif ve subjektif hükümlere bağlı olarak estetik yargının ortaya çıkmasına neden olur. Sanat, eserde öz varlığın sahip olduğu temel niteliklerdir. Sanatsal varlığın ortaya çıkmasına yardımcı olan biçim ise; herhangi bir nesnenin duyularımızla algılanabilen gerçeklikler olarak karşımıza çıkar. Sanatçı için doğadaki maddi özellikler algıları ortaya çıkartırken, algıların estetik amaçlar ile hoş giden biçimler oluşturma çabası ile ortaya çıkan eserler, var olan duygu durumlarının da ortaya çıkmasına yardımcı olur. Sanatçı, sanatın dinamiklerini algılamasından yola çıkarak geliştirilen bir bakış açısı ile sanatsal ifadesini yansıtırken gündelik nesnelere ve duygular arasındaki etkileşimden yola çıkarak sanatsal biçimleri oluşturmaya çalışır. Sanatçılar için algılanan biçimi gerçekleştiren nesnelere ve gündelik hayattaki nesnelere tinsel yaklaşımların bir sentezi olarak sanat eserleri oluşturmaya yardımcı olur. Toplum etkileyen kültürel, sosyopolitik, ekonomik olguların da sanat eserini oluşturmaya etki eden etmenlerin başında olduğunu söyleyebiliriz. Ayrıca sanat eseri üretiminde sanatçının içinde bulunduğu psikolojik duruma ve toplumsal yapıya bağlı olan değişkenler, dönüşüm sürecinde sosyal ve duygusal mekanizmalardan etkilenir. Böylelikle kendi başına sanatsal bir anlamı olmayan nesnelere, sanatçılar tarafından eserlere dönüştürme serüveninde birbiri ile etkileşim içerisinde. Araştırmamız sanat eserini oluşturan duygu durumları ve algılanmasındaki tinsel ve biçimsel etkilerin rolü ilgili nitel veriler irdelenerek yapılmıştır. Bu çalışmanın sanat alanına katkı sağlayacağı düşünülmektedir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Sanat, duygu durumları, algı, tinsel, biçim.

ABSTRACT: The emotional states that constitute a work of art are formed through the effects of a series of rules and regularities that explain the organization of various systems and also

* Doç. Dr.-Van Yüzüncü Yıl Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Güzel Sanatlar Eğitimi Bölümü/Van-seyhanmkalayci@gmail.com (Orcid: 0000-0001-9383-3885)



This article was checked by Turnitin.

form the foundation of a field of study. Emotions, formal pleasures, and spiritual approaches are among the phenomena that develop a theory defining the general definition of art, delineating its boundaries, and identifying the qualities that allow us to label something as a "work of art." Additionally, art is related with the aesthetics of nature and human subjective realities. The emotional sentiments, characterized as reality for the artist and manifested through seeing and understanding, are dependent on the subjects to be addressed in art. Art, an inherent human capability, is essentially a representation of existence. The tangible qualities of natural objects, considered reality for the artist, assist in perceiving and grasping these emotional feelings in art. Furthermore, individually arising emotional states give rise to aesthetic judgment based on both objective and subjective evaluations. The essential qualities inherent in the essence of the artwork are the foundation of artistic existence. The form that aids in the emergence of artistic presence appears as the perceptible reality of any object through our senses. For the artist, the material characteristics in nature bring forth perceptions. Artistic works produced for aesthetic purposes help bring forth the existing emotional states. The artist reflects their artistic expression through a perspective developed from their perception of the dynamics of art, attempting to create artistic forms based on the interaction between everyday objects and the senses. Objects that transport perceived forms into reality and everyday items, in interaction with the senses, aid in creating artworks as a synthesis of spiritual approaches. Cultural, sociopolitical, and economic factors influencing society are among the primary factors affecting the creation of artworks. Additionally, variables related to the artist's psychological state and societal structure play a role in this transformative process in the production of artworks. Thus, objects that inherently lack artistic meaning interact with each other in the journey of being transformed into artworks by artists. Our research is conducted by examining qualitative data related to the emotional states that constitute a work of art and their perceptual, spiritual, and formal effects. It is believed that this study will contribute to the field of art.

Keywords: *Art, emotional states, perception, spiritual, form.*

Introduction

To comprehend art, it is necessary first to understand what artworks are and to have knowledge about the fundamental topics of art history. Although we can define art as the conscious or unconscious need of humanity, which transforms its perception with an aesthetic perspective and existential consciousness in the face of nature, and begins drawing before even starting to speak, to depict animal and human figures on cave walls, the interpretation and arguments surrounding that drawn image can still be a subject of debate today, classifying it as an artwork. Art history systematically approaches and discusses these works, shedding light on them with scientific data, recording their creation dates, and documenting their technical specifications, providing us with information. Art can vary depending on societies, cultures, beliefs, geographical structures, and periods. When examining factors influencing art, we observe the interaction of both superficial and simple phenomena, as well as the perception of formal effects arising from relative and complex spirituality from person to person. Therefore, the perceived objects and meanings will vary depending on the observer's perspective on art and their accumulated artistic cultural knowledge. Identifying the artist and the artwork can be as complex as discussing the concept of art itself. Rather than defining art, this discussion shares only a few pieces of information about the countless relative situations in art, which have been and can be debated in the past and present.

In reality, art is a need within human consciousness to give order to objects and phenomena, thereby claiming its own existence. Hence, art serves as a bridge that connects humanity and objects through reaching existential consciousness. Art not only reflects a scientific understanding of art but is also a universal and relative concept, making it as unique as it is complex. Therefore, to perceive art, individuals must establish a connection between their spiritual approach and reality and possess the skill to describe formal approaches in the light of existing knowledge. One of the fundamental impulses between art and the artist is a unique form of expression that will redefine the world. This expression can sometimes occur through the artist's efforts to accept themselves and persuade society. In this regard, Berger states, *The artist must know the way to convince others of the reality of their own lies* (Berger, 2010:42).

Every work of art is the child of its era and often the source of our emotions, said Vassily Kandinsky (Kandinsky, 2001). In this context, a work of art not only serves as a source of information about its period but also functions as a genuine expression of our senses.

In other words, Kandinsky, who seeks art in the depths of the soul and believes that shaping art with spirituality is more accurate, contends, *Nature and forms are obstacles that block the path to elevating the human soul. Therefore, forms must be completely eliminated. In this way, the human soul can attain the perfect freedom of imagination, nourished by the flow of life through sound, light, and colors* (Rapelli, 2001:42). According to Barrett, *The formal characteristics of light, color, and patterns in a work are more important to Kandinsky than the subject it represents* (Barrett, 2015:19). Art opens a door to the non-secular inner realm; thus, non-secular art reveals the secular. This will be noticed and will only reflect the secular. Spirituality or transcendence in art varies with numerous variables and different approaches daily. While spirituality in art directs towards the transcendental, for Kandinsky, the foundation of emotion and sensitivity lies in personal spiritual life. This perspective is also akin to Islamic Sufism. The artist benefits from spirituality by creating a work that combines spirituality and mentality (Kandinsky, 2017).

The essence here is essentially an internal journey towards the whole, the absolute. Art is the emergence of both the consciousness of the soul and the possible emotional states in the mind. Kandinsky believes that a person's spirituality is a very good explanation of the soul's mind. Art is a pursuit of truth. Predicting spirituality for our overly materialistic era is quite challenging. The artist, on the other hand, is a person with heightened sensitivity, someone who thinks differently, seeks truth in the depths of their heart, understands the difference between looking and seeing, and reaches spirituality through the integration of the soul with the mind.

Art is not reality. Art is a deception that presents us with a reality, at least for us to grasp the reality offered to us, stated Andrew (Ritchie, 1951).

When we observe human beings and nature, the emotional states we perceive can vary from person to person. All emotional states and the factors causing them affect the inner world, influencing the perception of reality in the physical world, leading to different thoughts in artistic creations and those interpreting art. People seek spirituality in art, endeavoring to attain absolute knowledge arising from the mind or intellect.

In art, the emotional states influenced by the artwork, the emotions and ideas contained within it, and the effect creating a sense of excitement can be said to evoke emotional pleasure. Emotional pleasure is an emotional state experienced through the fulfillment of a purpose and desire. This state emerges as a reflection of liking, joy, and happiness. Pleasure, on the other hand, is an individually interpreted liking that varies from person to person. Formal pleasure is the sum of aesthetic values gained from the plastic properties of any natural object or artwork. Understanding formal pleasure and emotional pleasure leads to the pursuit of aesthetic values. The unique qualities of an artwork, through which it transforms into a truth to be apprehended, bring subjective and objective judgments based on liking or disliking within the framework of aesthetic evaluation in artistic works. This evaluation results in aesthetic judgments based on subjective and objective assessments of liking or disliking within the context of artistic works.

Factors Constituting an Artwork

When a work of art is examined holistically, it is observed that the content of all creative efforts encompasses the emotional states within the context of historical processes, intellectual and existential pursuits, considering and examining spiritual and formal factors as a whole. The materials used in the creation process of the artwork constitute a journey of understanding and interpreting the form and essence within its content. The consideration of aesthetic values and the technical dimension of the work of art involves all interactions. A work of art also reflects the cultural and belief characteristics of society. However, the structure of the materials used, the colors, texture, and form employed, reflect geographical features, as well as the artist's spiritual states that embody the inner perceptions.

The artist creates images in the mind through the participation of the senses. This process of formation is a psychological one, and the mode of reflection is unique to the individual. The artist transfers the developed image in the mind to the surface using various tools. Since each tool has its own dominion on the pictorial surface, the artist develops a style that transforms personal data into shapes and images. In the end, the shapes and images created are what the artist wants to see (Kara, 2011:2-3).

While the complexity of artistic data and perception can have different effects on individuals, the duration of perception can also vary. Among these factors, how the artist shapes their work with inspirational sources, how they attempt to convey it to the viewer, and the connection the artist establishes with the audience plays a crucial role. In this process, in addition

to emotional and mental effects, aesthetic and formal preferences also influence the perception of the work of art.

According to Kant, the human perceptual faculty consists of two primary elements: 1) Sensitivity in individual value, and 2) Perception in transcendental value. These two elements converge with the assistance of the imagination (Ersoy, 2016: 17). Similarly, McGilchrist posits that perceptions are not automatic outcomes of sensory mechanisms but are the principal projections, interpretations, creations, and products of purpose-directedness and imagination (Pallasmaa, 2009: 124). To explore the relationship between imagination and creativity, it is beneficial to first examine the concept of creativity and evaluate research on the interaction between creativity and imagination. P. Guilford, who asserts creativity as an innate trait, highlights a relationship between human intelligence and creative abilities (Bıyıklı & Gülen, 2018: 1275). Conversely, another perspective suggests that while individuals need to possess a certain level of intelligence for creativity, it is challenging to claim that individuals with high intelligence levels are inherently creative (Özerbaş, 201: 675-705). Creative thinking ability is an inherent trait in individuals, manifesting at different levels (Şahin & Danişman, 2017: 748). A significant characteristic of creative individuals is the strength of their imaginative faculties (Leboutiller & Marks, 2003: 29-40). According to this viewpoint, imagination is a cornerstone of creativity, and thus, artistic creation transforms into an individual product through the imagination. Artworks encapsulate environmental and personal factors such as geography, culture, language, and religion. While the artist's societal circumstances and events influence the artwork, the message the artwork aims to convey can also impact society. Therefore, the historical and economic processes, cultural values, social structure, architecture, and reflections of science and technology during the era of the artwork's creation are evident in the artwork.

The artist's inspiration, a catalyst or motivator for innovation, stems from nature, numerous elements within nature, and cultural reflections of societies. The artist can be influenced by various factors as sources of inspiration, and each artist's inspiration may differ. Ranging from personal experiences to cultural assets, these sources lead to an internal journey for the artist, transforming the aesthetic perspective that shapes the style between subjectivity and objectivity. Consequently, the sources of inspiration and motivation for artists are personal, influencing the emergence of various artistic styles.

The artist behaves like a child playing a game by creating their own imaginative world. Taking this world seriously, they distance themselves from reality and establish boundaries by enriching it with a rich emotional treasury (Freud, 1995).

When examining the factors that constitute the artist's work of art, the most fundamental categorization is as follows: *The artist's economic and*

sociocultural status, family and school education, the religious values of the society they live in, the geography they inhabit, natural conditions, the conditions of the period in which the work is performed, the artist's psychological and physical health, the artist's personal life, and social environment, etc... (Bourdieu, 2020; URL-1).

In a general sense, when scrutinizing the significant factors that influence the artist's creativity or may impact the creation of their work, the potential sources of inspiration are examined below in bullet points and are categorized according to the literature in the broadest sense:

-Emotional Experiences: Artists often use their inner emotional experiences as a source of inspiration. Emotions such as happiness, sadness, anger, and love emerge as significant elements influencing the creation of art.

-Spiritual Effects: Artworks have the potential to create spiritual experiences for both the artist and the audience. When analyzing a work of art, the viewer engages in an effort to connect the piece with the emotional states and formal effects learned throughout their life. The artist, in reflecting their inner journey, strives to establish aesthetic and perceptual perspectives in their works. Artworks can alter the world of perceptions through symbols, metaphors, and schematic concepts. These spiritual effects can prompt viewers to question and contemplate, requiring mental effort to interpret the work and enhancing its value while taking the audience on an inner journey.

-Personal Experiences: The experiences of existence, emotional encounters, and inner worlds acquired throughout an artist's life also serve as inspiration. Especially, emotional experiences, habits, and beliefs shaping preferences are among the elements that bring forth the artist's creations.

The relationships between emotional states in the creation of artworks and their spiritual and formal effects are intertwined. These relationships shape both the creative process of art and its interaction with the audience. For instance, a painter may depict happiness, sadness, longing, enthusiasm, or fear to express emotional variations.

-Formal Effects: Formal effects manifest as the visual or auditory features of an artwork, conceptualized through our senses. The techniques used in creating a piece, such as the colors employed in a painting that contribute to its coherence, can shape the viewer's perception. For example, the dynamic distribution of vibrant colors in a piece can evoke energy and excitement, while the use of calm colors may create a static order, inducing a sense of calmness and tranquility in the viewer.

-Nature and Environmental Factors: Images reflecting the unique beauty of nature, as well as visuals conveying environmental messages (such as global disasters) or natural art forms, can be a source of inspiration for many artists. Artworks that shape paintings, photographs, and sculptures can be influenced by nature.

-Other Artworks: Art forms and works by different artists, including contemporary art, can be a source of inspiration. Analyzing products from other artists can aid in the development of new images and perspectives.

-Artistic Movements and Styles: Movements that have contributed to history and the styles of artists shaping those movements have served as inspiration for artists in subsequent periods. For instance, movements like the Renaissance, Dadaism, or abstract art can influence the creation process of artworks.

-Other Art Forms: Throughout history, other art forms, such as music and literature shaped by sounds and movements created to express humanity's power over nature, have been effective sources of inspiration for artists.

-Social and Cultural Issues: Social and cultural events can help convey the messages artists wish to express in their works. These elements serve as powerful means of artistic expression.

-Dreams and Imagination: Dreams and imagination assist in the creation of unique and abstract works of art, contributing to the birth of original artistic creations.

Therefore, sources of inspiration that trigger the creativity of the artist or may lead to the creation of a work are components of a complex process. When these influences come together, we can say that the meaning and impact of works of art can become richer and deeper.

When works of art are perceived by the audience, the viewer's own emotional states and experiences are also crucial. Viewers, while observing the work, can perceive it differently based on their emotional states and experiences. For instance, a person in a happy mood may evaluate a painting more positively, whereas it may be approached from a different perspective when the same artwork is viewed during a melancholic period. Viewers interpret artworks according to their own emotional states.

The connection between the artist and the audience is highly significant for the artist. The audience, by providing feedback, can influence the artist's ideas and thoughts. The artist's connection with the audience is one of the fundamental uncertainties of art and plays a crucial role in the emergence of the effectiveness of works of art. Establishing a connection with the audience plays a critical role in conveying the emotion, thought, or message that the artist aims to communicate.

Some Fundamental Thoughts on the Connection of Artists with Viewers

Artworks can evoke emotional moments for the audience. Whether it be a painting, sculpture, song, or literary work, it enriches life by offering the viewer a unique emotional experience. The artist, by creating emotional depth in their work, facilitates the formation of an emotional connection with the viewer.

As artists provide aesthetic subject matter through their creations, they also enhance aesthetic perception and engage in communication with the audience. In the process of encouraging the viewer to contemplate, the artist can prompt aesthetic perceptual evaluation and inquiry through their artworks.

By inviting the viewer to question their own perspective and understand the work, the artist establishes a connection. Simultaneously, these artworks may offer an aesthetic experience. The aesthetics conveyed through colors, forms, and textures in the artwork become meaningful, eliciting a sense of pleasure and admiration.

Some artists choose to involve the audience as part of the artwork. For example, interactive artworks stimulate more personal emotions by keeping the viewer engaged in the interaction. We can refer to this as involving the viewer.

In the context of societal and cultural connections, artworks can address societal and cultural issues, prompting the viewer to contemplate these matters. Such works create a connection between the viewer and society, engaging them in the process of reflection on these issues.

Some works of art, on the other hand, are designed to entertain or draw the interest of the viewer. We can say that, in some cultures, these works are considered artistic genres. An artist may employ highly absurd or grotesque means to influence and capture the viewer's interest.

It can be argued that an artwork effective in expression and communication can be used as a tool to convey a message. The artist's goal may be to express or narrate the thoughts of a society and oneself. Through this communication, it is easily understood how the viewer reacts to the artwork.

It is possible to interpret life in a different way through works of art. The communication between the artist's intention and the viewer's interpretation enhances the power of art. By utilizing their own experiences and perspectives, the artist can strengthen their work, providing them with the ability to comprehend and interpret the message in artworks.

Although works of art may possess various artistic elements from a visual standpoint, achieving aesthetically satisfying qualities occurs through the accurate emphasis of these elements. The proper use of artistic elements that integrate the artwork can endow it with physical qualities, leading to the formation of aesthetic satisfaction in the viewer.

Conclusion

Since the beginning of existence, humankind has grappled with the awareness of being, driven by an intrinsic motivation to create products that facilitate and imbue life with meaning. Numerous emotional states and factors contributing to the emergence of these states have influenced the life cycle, shaping the efforts to create meaningful products. These factors, acting

as catalysts for internal contemplation, give rise to artistic works as reflections of emotions, concurrently serving as one of the reasons for human existence. Art is an internal reflection that holds up a mirror to life. In addition to shedding light on the struggle of existence, events and phenomena that evoke positive feelings in humans have significantly influenced artists, artworks, and the impact on the recipient's life. Moreover, various disciplines rooted in existential reality and aesthetic sensitivity, based on existentialism, have influenced the perception and interpretation of art. Therefore, it can be said that the fundamental basis of the spiritual and formal effects between the artist's work and the recipient is the enduring sense of existence throughout life.

The perceived form in an artwork simultaneously represents the material existence. The essence in the artwork manifests as an expression of the aesthetic values it possesses. In other words, the essence serves as both the realized form of content and the intended message to the recipient, such as the emphasized central idea. Therefore, correctly emphasizing the relationship between the spiritual and formal aspects in an artwork facilitates the perception of the emotional states that constitute the artwork, simultaneously reflecting the artist's emotional states.

In the process between the artist, artwork, and recipient, the perception and interpretation of art involve the conceptualization of emotions and the message or content intended as a result of these emotions. This conceptualization occurs through the recipient's perception, guided by spiritual and formal influences, shaping the theoretical and perceptual approaches to the artwork. With an objective and subjective approach, the artist, by utilizing the emotional states that form this aesthetic integrity, establishes a connection between the external and internal realities of the outer world and inner world, employing the interaction of spiritual and formal elements in the recipient. Additionally, the artist, by shaping and internalizing societal cultural values, brings forth the conceptualization of the artwork, making it amenable to conceptual and perceptual interpretations, thus undergoing a transformative process.

REFERENCES

Written Sources

- Barrett, T. (2015). *Neden bu sanat? Çağdaş sanatta estetik ve eleştiri*. (çev.: Esra Ermert), İstanbul: Hayalperest Yayınevi.
- Berger, J. (2010). *Picasso'nun başarısı ve başarısızlığı*. (çev.: Yurdanur Salman- Müge Gürsoy Sökmen), Metis Yayınları, İstanbul.
- Bıyıklı, E. N.- Gülen, A. L. (2018). Hayal gücü ve yaratıcılık kavramlarının tasarım sürecine etkisi. *İdil*, 7(50), 1273-1277.
- Bourdieu, P. (2020). *Sanatın kuralları*. İstanbul: Alfa Yayınları.
- Şahin, F. - Danışman, Ş. (2017). Yaratıcı kişilik özellikleri ölçeği: Güvenilirlik ve geçerlik çalışması. *Karabük Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 7(2), 747-760.

- Ersoy, A. (2016). *Sanat kavramlarına giriş*. İstanbul: Hayalperest Yayınevi.
- Kandinsky, W. (2001). *Sanatta ruhsallık üzerine*. (çev.: Gülin Ekinci), İstanbul: Altıkırkbeş Yayınları.
- Kandinsky, W. (2017). *Sanatta tinsellik üzerine*. (çev.: Özkan Eroğlu), İstanbul: Tekhne Yayınları.
- Kara, D. (2011). Sanat yapıtının oluşum süreci. *Süleyman Demirel Üniversitesi Güzel Sanatlar Fakültesi Hakemli Dergisi Art-E*, 4(8), 1-5.
- Leboutillier, N. - Marks, D. F. (2003). Mental imagery and creativity: A metaanalytic review study. *British Journal of Psychology*, 94 (1), 29-44.
- Pallasmaa, J. (2009). *The thinking hand: Existential and embodied wisdom in architecture*. New York: Wiley.
- Rapelli, P. (2001). *Art book Kandinsky soyut sanatın öncüsü*. (çev.: Özge Özbek), Ankara: Dost Kitapevi.
- Ritchie, C. A. (1951). *Abstract painting and sculpture in America*. New York: The Museum of Modern Art.
- Freud, S. (1995). *Sanat ve sanatçılar üzerine*. (çev.: Kâmuran Şıpal), İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları.
- Özerbaş, M. A. (2011). Yaratıcı düşünme öğrenme ortamının akademik başarı ve bilgilerin kalıcılığa etkisi. *Gazi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 31(3), 675-705.

Electronic Sources

URL-1: <https://www.sosyologer.com/sanat-eseri-nedir-sanat-eserinin-ozellikleri-nelerdir/> (Erişim: 01.01.2024)

"İyi Yayın Üzerine Kılavuzlar ve Yayın Etiği Komitesi'nin (COPE) Davranış Kuralları" çerçevesinde aşağıdaki beyanlara yer verilmiştir. / The following statements are included within the framework of "Guidelines on Good Publication and the Code of Conduct of the Publication Ethics Committee (COPE)":

Etik Kurul Belgesi/Ethics Committee Approval: Makale, Etik Kurul Belgesi gerektirmemektedir./Article does not require an Ethics Committee Approval.

Çıkar Çatışması Beyanı/Declaration of Conflicting Interests: Bu makalenin araştırması, yazarlığı veya yayınlanmasıyla ilgili olarak yazarların potansiyel bir çıkar çatışması yoktur. / There is no potential conflict of interest for the authors regarding the research, authorship or publication of this article.

Yazarın Notu/Author's Note: Bu makalenin ilk versiyonu, Türkçe olarak 14-16 Temmuz 2023 tarihlerinde Tiflis-Gürcistan'da gerçekleştirilen Avrasya 8. Uluslararası Sosyal Bilimler Kongresinde sözlü olarak sunulmuş ve tam metin kitabında Türkçe olarak yayımlanmıştır./The first version of this article was orally presented in Turkish at the 8th International Congress of Social Sciences of Eurasia held in Tbilisi-Georgia on July 14-16, 2023 and published in Turkish in the full text book.